

TITLE: Evaluation of Seed and Fertilizer Opener Configurations for Optimizing Seed and Fertilizer Placement in Simultaneous, Single-Pass Operations with Air Drills under Differing Cropping Systems.

PRINCIPAL INVESTIGATOR: Gregg R. Carlson, Agronomist, Havre

Personnel: Peggy F. Lamb, Research Associate, NARC, Havre
Jeff D. Whitmus, Research Assistant III, NARC, Havre
Eleri Haney, Research Assistant I, NARC, Havre
Darrin L. Boss, Animal Scientist, NARC, Havre
Robert N. Stougaard, Weed Scientist, NWARC, Kalispell
Cooperating Dealers and Manufacturers

OBJECTIVES:

It is the objective of this project to evaluate air drill openers and systems for the production of cereal grains under varying cropping conditions and systems in northern Montana.

From crop year 1997 through crop year 2004, the project was limited primarily to evaluation of “double-shoot” air drill openers using a research-scale ‘Concord’ air drill provided by Northern Ag Service of Malta, Montana with opener hardware provided by various cooperating manufacturers and dealers.

Beginning in crop year 2005, project investigations were expanded to include comparison of seed and fertilizer placement configurations via “double-shoot opener” and “mid-row bander” systems using loaned ‘Bourgault’ commercial-scale air seeder and air till drill equipment provided for research purposes by Bourgault Industries Ltd and supported by Tilleman Motor Company of Havre, Montana with opener hardware provided by various cooperating manufacturers and dealers. Air drill studies were not conducted in 2009 due to wet field conditions delaying planting beyond the cut-off date deemed reasonable for obtaining meaningful results with spring wheat at this location.

RESULTS:

On-Going Opener Studies Conducted with the ‘Concord’ Air Drill:

Yield performance data for all such opener trials conducted at Havre by NARC-Agronomy since the air drill investigations began in 1997 are presented in Table 1. A “10-Year, Comparable Average” summary for all openers evaluated in at least three of the ten years (1998-2008) with spring wheat on mechanical or chemical fallow at Havre is presented in Table 2. ‘Concord’ air drill data for crop year 2005 is not included due to an equipment malfunction (not associated with the openers themselves) that variably impacted opener performance. Figures 1 through 6 comprise an opener and post-harvest photo gallery for spring wheat plots established with openers evaluated in 2008. See reports from previous years for data and photo galleries associated with other openers evaluated over time.

SUMMARY:

Producers contemplating purchase of an air drill logically base their decisions on a number of variables to include manufacturer, dealer support, features, availability, price, etc. A decade ago, limited attention was given to the type and style of interchangeable openers supplied with a new or used air drill. In some situations, dealers want to encourage a prospective buyer to consider a particular type of opener thought to be most appropriate for the grower’s own conditions and needs, but they may be reluctant to do so if less sophisticated and less costly openers being selected on a competitor’s machine would result in loss of a sale. Due to the cost associated with outfitting a machine of average width with openers, producers prefer to limit their on-farm inventory to one or at the most perhaps two differing scenarios to cover nearly all planting needs. Openers range widely in cost, but it is not uncommon for producers to spend an average of \$100-\$150 per shank which amounts to \$4,500-\$7,500 or more for a typical air drill. Thus, few producers can afford to make very many selection mistakes in a “trial and error” approach before finding the opener and placement configuration most appropriate for them. It is estimated that approximately 70% or more of the dryland wheat and barley in major producing areas of Montana is sown with air drills. Thus, producers are keenly interested in unbiased evaluation of air drill opener and system options.

Our involvement with air drill opener investigations began in 1997 when Northern Agricultural Research Center hosted

the third Montana “Fields of Tomorrow” show sponsored by Monsanto Company and KMON Country Radio with trade show support of numerous other vendors of agricultural supplies, equipment and technology. Part of NARC’s contract for hosting the show included on-site evaluation of air drill openers. The use of a research-scale ‘Concord’ air drill was provided to Northern Agricultural Research Center by the manufacturer in cooperation with area dealer, Northern Ag Service of Malta. At the same time, a research-scale ‘Conserva-Pak’ air drill was purchased by MSU for use in conducting a series of large-scale cropping systems projects in Montana funded by USDA’s Special Grant Program. Initially the MSU unit was available for inclusion in the opener evaluation studies at Havre and Moccasin. Use schedules with other projects at two different research centers have since limited the use of the Conserva-Pak in specific seed and fertilizer placement investigations. Carlson has conducted air drill opener investigations each year since 1997 with the Concord machine. Manufacturers and/or dealers provide all opener hardware at no cost to the Research Center in exchange for development of unbiased performance evaluation information.

Square-wall, 6-inch wide ‘Titan’ pneumatic packer tires/ wheels were utilized with all openers in 2001-2008 trials with the Concord machine. Standard 165x15R radial pneumatic packer tires/wheels were utilized with all openers in previous Concord trials. The wider Titan packer tires afford more appropriate packing with opener scenarios featuring wider seed bands, but may be less appropriate than narrower packer tires for packing narrow seed band scenarios. Interchanging packer wheels/tires in addition to the openers themselves for different opener configurations within a single trial is not feasible in view of the time and effort required when for experimental standardization all planting treatments must be imposed within a single day.

The Concord unit has also been integral to other research investigations conducted by Stougaard and Carlson involving the use of widened seed bands and increased rates of seeding for reduction of wild oat competition in the production of spring wheat. Carlson, Lamb, Stougaard and Whitmus are further involved in developing other crop and crop pest management strategies utilizing Variable Rate Technology (VRT) equipment added to the Concord with funds provided in part by the Montana Wheat and Barley Committee, Northern Agricultural Research Center and Northern Ag Service. Boss, Carlson and Lamb utilized these technologies in yet a fourth collaborative effort where they investigated the effects of barley class, variable seed band widths, variable seeding rates, and variable harvest end points on both forage and grain end use parameters.

The Bourgault equipment, consisting of the center section of a commercial-scale Bourgault 5710 Air Hoe Drill equipped with Series 25 Mid Row Banders and a three-compartment Bourgault 5350 leading air seeder/cart, was delivered to the research center in 2005 on loan for research purposes by Bourgault Industries Ltd at Minot, ND with local dealer support provided by Tilleman Motor Company of Havre.

Growers are generally aware that there are limits with respect to the amount of actual $N+K_2O$ that can be delivered together with seed before germination and seedling damage will occur. Older guidelines were developed via research conducted at a time when the principal granular nitrogen fertilizer source was Ammonium Nitrate. With Urea now being the most commonly used granular nitrogen fertilizer product, newer guidelines call for lower limits. In MSU’s 2005 Extension Bulletin 161 (*“Fertilizer Guidelines for Montana Crops”*) <http://msuextension.org/publications/AgandNaturalResources/EB0161.pdf> , the following statement appears under “Special Conditions” for spring and winter wheat fertilization:

Drill-row applications of $N+K_2O$ should not exceed 20 lbs/a. When using Urea as the N source, drill-row application of $N+K_2O$ should not exceed 10 lbs/a with a 6-7 inch row spacing. When using a wider spacing, do not apply any urea with the seed. With newer drills and openers, the mixture of seed, fertilizer and soil is much greater, so more fertilizer can be placed in the “row” due to the dilution of potential detrimental impacts from salts and ammonia on germination and growth.

Optimum seedbed moisture, finer-textured soils, and wider seed/fertilizer distribution bands can each serve to reduce such detrimental effects, but there are still limits. Reluctance to meet the additional investment cost for air drills with dual-air delivery systems is cause for some growers to employ broadcast fertilizer application practices or to “push the envelope” with respect to applying $N+K_2O$ fertilizers with seed.

The Bourgault equipment has made it more feasible to evaluate such seed and fertilizer relationships under conditions more equivalent to those dealt with by commercial growers. Germination and/or seedling damage associated with over-application of $N+K_2O$ fertilizers delivered with seed is not always obvious via casual observation of stands. It is interesting to note that in the 2006 study reported previously – the number of Plants/SqFt was reduced by 29 percent

when applying 30-40-0 with seed and 40-0-0 via pre-plant broadcast in comparison with plant populations achieved with the same seeding rate and seed openers where the entire 70-40-0 fertilizer application was placed via mid row banders. In 2006, this same treatment involving over-application of N+K₂O with seed resulted in a 23% wheat plant population reduction in comparison to the overall average population achieved by the other seven treatment configurations in the trial. In this case, yield was not significantly reduced since the population reduction resulted in compensation with a greater number of fertile culms per plant. It is likely that such could not always be expected to occur. In 2007, even though higher rates of intentional "over-application" of urea nitrogen in direct contact with seed were employed; early plant development stages were favored by above normal precipitation likely serving to avert germination and seedling damage that would have otherwise been expected to occur.



TABLE 1. ¹YIELD MEAN SUMMARY (Bu/Ac) FOR ALL "DOUBLE-SHOOT" AIR DRILL OPENER EVALUATIONS AT HAVRE - NORTHERN AGRICULTURAL RESEARCH CENTER (1997-2008)

(See Reports for Individual Investigations for Additional Performance Parameters, Site & Climatic Specifics, and Project Management Details)



NO-TILL RECROP	CHM+TILL FALLOW	CHM+TILL FALLOW	NO-TILL FALLOW	NO-TILL FALLOW	NO-TILL FALLOW	NO-TILL FALLOW	NO-TILL FALLOW	NO-TILL FALLOW	NO-TILL FALLOW	NO-TILL FALLOW	NO-TILL FALLOW	NO-TILL FALLOW
SW-1997 (>BLY)	WW-1998 (>BLY)	SW-1998 (>BLY)	SW-1999 (>BLY)	SW-2000 (>WWW)	SW-2001 (>SW)	SW-2002 (>WWW)	SW-2003 (>BLY)	SW-2004 (>WWW)	SW-2006 (>SW)	SW-2007 (>BLY)	SW-2008 (>OILS)	
HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE	HAVRE

ANDERSON (Case-Concord) Triple Shooter	39.3	27.4	35.9	26.7	26.6	38.1						
ATOMJET Side Band				27.9	31.1	37.9	19.4	33.6	27.0			
ATOMJET Paired Row						36.5	18.3	34.0	27.3			
ATOMJET CB-15 w /TECHNOTILL Precision Packer								32.8				
BOURGAULT TILLAGE TOOLS 3" Paired Row									29.1	28.8	31.9	
CONCORD LD w /Case-McKay 6" LD Sweep & K3 Knife	38.1											
CONCORD LD w /Case-McKay 11" LD Sweep & K3 Knife	35.3											
CONSERVA PAK System	22.4	36.7	27.2									
DUTCH SUPER EAGLE w /3.5" Paired Row Attachment			38.9	30.8	30.6	40.1	17.7	32.6				
DUTCH SUPER EAGLE w /5.5" Paired Row Attachment			37.8	28.2	28.8	38.4	17.8	34.3				
DUTCH 3.5" Precision Paired Row							16.7	35.0	29.8	30.0	32.7	
DUTCH Low Draft Paired Row									27.6	31.0	32.9	
DUTCH S.E. w /FARMLAND Mid Row Fertilizer Banding Disk					27.2	36.8	16.0	34.5	25.4			
FARMLAND LD w /Case-McKay 6" LD Sweep & K3 Knife		28.2	38.7	25.6	28.5	38.1	17.3	35.0	28.4			
FARMLAND LD w /Case-McKay 11" LD Sweep & K3 Knife		25.9	38.6	23.6	26.4	40.4	16.7	33.4	27.9			
FARMLAND SB1-SBS1 w /3" Knock-On Spoon & K3 Knife		35.4	21.2									
FARMLAND SB1-SBS1 w /4" Chrome Sweep & K3 Knife	19.5											
FARMLAND SB1-SBS1 w /4" Knock-On Sweep & K3 Knife		40.0	25.6	35.4	26.6	27.4						
FARMLAND SB1-SBS1 w /6" Knock-On Sweep & K3 Knife	23.9	41.0	24.0	35.7	28.1	27.4	38.8	17.2	32.2	28.5	30.6	31.8
FARMLAND SB1-SBS1 w /10" Knock-On Sweep & K3 Knife			23.5	35.2								
FLEXICOIL STEALTH w /Single Side Band Attachment	23.5	42.2	25.3	30.7								
FLEXICOIL STEALTH w /Paired Row Attachment	23.4	31.2	25.7	27.8	27.9	27.5	40.4	17.4	34.5	26.0		
GEN 200 T2	23.4											
GEN 200 T2x2		41.1	26.3	37.0	27.1	28.1	38.9	16.5	33.1	26.7	30.8	32.2
GEN 300 T2 Paired Row									26.4	29.5	31.2	
MORRIS Gumbo Boot				24.3	27.8		18.3					
SWEDE	22.5	36.8		26.3								
SITE MEANS	22.4	37.9	25.5	35.6	26.9	28.1	38.6	17.4	33.8	27.5	30.1	32.1
LSD (.05)	2.8	5.3	3.7	4.4	2.9	4.9	5.6	2.1	2.8	5.6	1.3	2.0

¹G.R. Carlson, Northern Agricultural Research Center, Havre - 2005 data lost to intermittent seed metering roller malfunction.

All openers are "double-shoot" configurations with target seeding rate at 60#/ac and fertilizer at 70#N, 40#P₂O₅, and 25#K₂O via blended granular fertilizer at 251# product/ac (except 2008 at 0-0-0 fertilizer due to residual soil N inventory).

TABLE 2. Ten-Year Yield Summary on Selected Entries from Dryland Fallow Evaluation of Double-Shoot Air Drill Openers with Spring Wheat. Northern Agricultural Research Center, Havre, Montana. 1998-2008.

	No. of YEARS TESTED	1/ YIELD (Bushels Per Acre)							AVERAGE for YEARS TESTED	% of CHECK YIEL	10-YEAR COMP. AVERAGE YIELD
		NO-TILL FALLOW SW- (>SW HAVRE	NO-TILL FALLOW SW- (>WW HAVRE	NO-TILL FALLOW SW- (>BLY) HAVRE	NO-TILL FALLOW SW- (>WW) HAVRE	NO-TILL FALLOW SW- (>SW) HAVRE	NO-TILL FALLOW SW- (>BLY) HAVRE	NO-TILL FALLOW SW- (>OILS) HAVRE			
DUTCH SUPER EAGLE w/3.5" Paired Row Attachment	6	30.6	40.1	17.7	32.6				31.8	106.3	31.3
FARMLAND LD w/Case-McKay 6" LD Sweep & K3 Knife	8	28.5	38.1	17.3	35.0	28.4			30.0	103.4	30.4
DUTCH SUPER EAGLE w/5.5" Paired Row Attachment	6	28.8	38.4	17.8	34.3				30.9	103.3	30.4
DUTCH 3.5" Precision Paired Row	5			16.7	35.0	29.8	30.0	32.7	28.8	102.8	30.3
ATOM JET Side Band	6	31.1	37.9	19.4	33.6	27.0			29.5	102.7	30.2
GEN 200 T2x2	10	28.1	38.9	16.5	33.1	26.7	30.8	32.2	29.7	100.8	29.7
DUTCH Low Draft Paired Row	3					27.6	31.0	32.9	30.5	100.7	29.6
FARMLAND LD w/Case-McKay 11" LD Sweep & K3 Knife	8	26.4	40.4	16.7	33.4	27.9			29.1	100.5	29.6
ANDERSON (Case-Concord) Triple Shooter	5	26.6	38.1						30.9	100.4	29.6
FARMLAND SB1-SBS1 w/6" Knock-On Sweep & K3 Knife	10	27.4	38.8	17.2	32.2	28.5	30.6	31.8	29.4	100.0	29.4
FARMLAND SB1-SBS1 w/4" Knock-On Sweep & K3 Knife	4	27.4							28.7	99.8	29.4
ATOM JET Paired Row	4		36.5	18.3	34.0	27.3			29.0	99.5	29.3
GEN 300 T2 Paired Row	3					29.1	28.8	31.9	29.9	98.8	29.1
FLEXICOIL STEALTH w/ Paired Row Attachment	8	27.5	40.4	17.4	34.5	26.0			28.4	98.0	28.8
DUTCH S.E. w/FARMLAND Mid-Row Fertilizer Banding Disk	5	27.2	36.8	16.0	34.5	25.4			28.0	97.1	28.6
MORRIS Gumbo Boot	3	27.8		18.3					23.5	96.8	28.5
BOURGAULT TILLAGE TOOLS 3" Paired Row	3					26.4	29.5	31.2	29.0	95.8	28.2
ENTRY MEANS (For Entries Included in this Summary)		27.7	38.5	17.4	33.8	27.5	30.1	32.1			29.5
SITE MEANS (For All Entries Included in Original Trial)		28.1	38.6	17.4	33.8	27.5	30.1	32.1			
LSD (.05) (For All Entries Included in Original Trial)		4.9	5.6	2.1	2.8	5.6	1.3	2.0			

Check Entry is (FARMLAND SB1-SBS1 w/6" Knock-On Sweep & K3 Backswept Knife).

1/ See separate reports for individual investigations by year for additional performance parameters, site & climatic specifics and project management details.

2/ Only the most recent 7 years data are shown, but summary calculations include all years noted (2005 data lost to equipment malfunction).

3/ Percent of check entry yield performance for the same data years as those in which a given entry was tested.

4/ 10-Yr Comparable Average Yield = (x/y)*z where x = average yield of a given entry for years tested, y = average yield for the Check Entry for the same years, and z = 10-Yr average yield for the Check Entry.

2005 data lost to intermittent seed metering roller malfunction.

Figure 1. BOURGAULT 3" Paired Row (Row Style = Solid, Seed Band Width = 4.9 Inches)



Figure 2. DUTCH 3.5" Paired Row (Row Style = Solid, Seed Band Width = 5.1 Inches)



Figure 3. DUTCH Low Draft Paired Row (Row Style = Paired/Joined, Seed Band Width = 6.0 Inches)



Figure 4. FARMLAND SB1-SBS1 w/ 6" Sweep & Backswept Knife (Solid, Seed Band Width = 5.8 Inches)



Figure 5. GEN 200 T2x2 Paired Row (Row Style = Paired/Separate, Seed Band Width = 6.9 Inches)



Figure 6. GEN 300 T2 Paired Row (Row Style = Paired/Joined, Seed Band Width = 5.9 Inches)

